ID 146 African Bushmeat in Brussels: high prices and high levels of misidentification

Sophie Gombeer^{1*}, Casimir Nebesse², Prescott Musaba², Steve Ngoy², Marc Peeters³, Yoo Ree Van Bourgonie¹, Kenny Meganck⁴, Nathalie Smitz⁴, Thierry Backeljau^{1,5}, Marc De Meyer⁴ and Erik Verheyen^{1,5}

¹Royal Belgian Institute of Natural Sciences (BopCo), 1000 Brussels, Belgium; ²University of Kisangani, B.P. 2012, Kisangani, DR Congo; ³Royal Belgian Institute of Natural Sciences (BIOPOLS), 1000 Brussels, Belgium; ⁴Royal Museum for Central Africa (BopCo), 3080 Tervuren, Belgium; ⁵Evolutionary Ecology Group, University of Antwerp, 2610 Antwerp, Belgium.

* Corresponding author e-mail: sophie.gombeer@naturalsciences.be http://bopco.myspecies.info/

Notwithstanding the prohibition at national and European Union level to import individual consignments of meat (products), various studies (Chaber et al., 2010; Falk et al., 2013; Wood et al. 2014) report that large quantities of meat, including bushmeat, enter Europe via its international airports without authorization or certification. These studies suggest the existence of an African bushmeat market in Europe.



In order to get an impression of the nature, extent and value of African bushmeat trade in Brussels, 142 travellers waiting at the African departure gates of Brussels Airport were questioned about their travel and import habits. Also, we interviewed 16 Brussels citizens of African descent who frequently travel to Central African countries. In addition, we bought 15 pieces of bushmeat in African grocery shops in Brussels to explore: (i) which species are being sold, (ii) if these are endangered or legally protected, and (iii) the price of bushmeat in Brussels.

The interviews revealed that food from the country of origin is considered superior by the interviewees and that, notwithstanding the (limited) awareness of the rules and policies, the interviewees frequently import African food. The interviews also revealed that apart from the authenticity and flavour arguments, bushmeat trafficking is considered as an easy way to earn money or pay the travel expenses, while the risk of getting caught by customs control is perceived

Results from a survey interviewing 142 travellers at the departure gates for African destinations at Brussels Airport (Belgium). The map shows the departure airport (Brussels 🌖 and the African destinations of the interviewees (🌒), as well as the distribution of nationalities 🔎 and origins 🕋 of the interviewees. The figure on the right displays how many of the interviewees indicated to 'import' jewels, art, basketry, fruit & vegetables, seeds, medication, fish and meat (from wild animals) on occasion when returning to Europe. The eight interviewees declaring to sometimes 'import' meat were of European and African nationalities and/or origin.



In-depth interviews were conducted with 16 travelling expatriates with a balanced age (24 - 55 y.o.) and gender (50 / 50 male-female) spread. The participants originated from 9 different countries and were interviewed for approximately two hours in two groups. All interviewees were well educated, living in Belgium and regularly travelling to their home countries. A few quotes (translated from French) are displayed here to (i) exemplify the importance of the connection to the home country, (ii) to clarify the reasons for bringing food items into Belgium, and (iii) to illustrate the perception of import rules and regulations.

as very low.

SOLD BY VENDORS AS:





African buffalo







antelope





Potamochoerus porcus by Dennis Jarvis [CC BY-SA 2.0]; Bos taurus by Keith Weller/USDA [Public domain]; Tragelaphus spekii by Ivanhoe [CC BY-SA 3.0]; Cephalophus

callipygus by XKD [CC BY-SA 2.0]; Philantomba monticola by Bart Wursten [CC BY-NC-SA 2.0]; Atherurus africanus by Glamhag [CC BY-NC-SA 2.0]; Thryonomys

swinderianus by Aurélia Zizo [Attribution]; Cercopithecus neglectus by David J. Stang [CC BY-SA 4.0]; Cercopithecus ascanius by Denise [CC BY-SA 2.0].





IDENTIFIED BY COI & CYTB AS:

Potamochoerus spec.

red river hog or bushpig

Cephalophus spec. ‡ duiker







cane rat

Thryonomys swinderianus

Cercopithecus neglectus

Cercopithecus ascanius

red-tailed monkey/guenon

De Brazza's guenon

Bushmeat was not on display in any of the African grocery stores visited, but after asking specifically for bushmeat, a total of 15 pieces could be purchased from five different shops in Brussels. The meat was sold using local African or common species names and was said to originate from the Democratic Republic of the Congo.

DNA-based identifications revealed that the 15 bushmeat pieces comprised nine potential mammal species, and that eight of the 15 pieces were sold under a wrong name. None of the nine species are endangered according to the IUCN Red List, but two monkey and two duiker species are CITES-listed. The price of bushmeat in Brussels can reach twice the Belgian market price of a piece of premium livestock meat, up to € 62 per kg, but does not seem to be related to the species being sold.

This study confirms that various kinds of bushmeat, including CITES listed species, are sold in Brussels. The high prices confirm the luxury status of the product, while DNA-based identifications demonstrate a high incidence of mislabelling. This might be due to the involvement of several intermediate vendors and the fragmented and heavily smoked nature of the meat, making it difficult to identify. Yet, accurate bushmeat species identifications are necessary to assess the hunting pressure on wild animal populations and to implement proper protective measures.

Picture credits:

Every arrow represents one piece of meat bought in Brussels. The colours & dashes indicate:

- → the DNA-based identification confirms the information given by the vendor;
- + the DNA-based identification differs from the information given by the vendor;
- \rightarrow the information given by the vendor is very vague (higher taxonomic level).

‡ DNA-based species ID using COI and cytb were not able to distinguish among the closely related Cephalophus callipygus, C. ogilbyi and C. weynsi. Only C. ogilbyi is CITES-listed



REFERENCES

Chaber, A-L., S. Allebone-Webb, Y. Lignereux, A.A. Cunningham, and J.M. Rowcliffe. 2010. "The Scale of Illegal Meat Importation from Africa to Europe via Paris." Conservation Letters 3 (5). Wiley/Blackwell (10.1111): 317-21.

Falk, H., S. Dürr, R. Hauser, K. Wood, B. Tenger, M. Lörtscher, and G. Schüpbach-Regula. 2013. "Illegal Import of Bushmeat and Other Meat Products into Switzerland on Commercial Passenger Flights." Revue Scientifique et Technique-Office International Des Epizooties 32 (3): 727-39.

Wood, K.L., B. Tenger, N.V. Morf, and A. Kratzer. 2014. "Report to CITES: CITES-Listed Species at Risk from the Illegal Trafficking of Bushmeat; Results of a 2012 Study in Switzerland's International Airports." Switzerland.

